

1 SIMEON M. HERSKOVITS  
2 New Mexico State Bar No.16860  
3 ADVOCATES FOR COMMUNITY AND ENVIRONMENT  
4 129-C Kit Carson Road  
5 Taos, NM 87571  
6 Phone: (505) 758-7202  
7 Fax: (505) 758-7203  
8 e-mail: [simeon@communityandenvironment.net](mailto:simeon@communityandenvironment.net)

9 CHERI K. EMM-SMITH  
10 Nevada State Bar No. 3055  
11 MINERAL COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY  
12 P.O. Box 1210  
13 Hawthorne, NV 89415  
14 Phone: (775) 945-3636  
15 Fax: (775) 945-0700  
16 E-mail: [districtattorney@mineralcountynv.org](mailto:districtattorney@mineralcountynv.org)

17 Attorneys for MINERAL COUNTY, NEVADA

18 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
19 FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEVADA

20 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, ) In Equity No. C-125  
21 ) CV-N-73-125-ECR(RAM)  
22 Plaintiff, )  
23 )  
24 WALKER RIVER PAIUTE TRIBE, )  
25 ) **MINERAL COUNTY’S PRELIMINARY**  
26 Plaintiff-Intervenor, ) **LEGAL THEORIES**  
27 vs. )  
28 )  
29 WALKER RIVER IRRIGATION DISTRICT, )  
30 a corporation, et al., )  
31 )  
32 Defendants. )

33 Pursuant to the Court’s August 20, 2007, Order, Mineral County submits the following  
34 preliminary legal theories. This filing is intended to assist the parties in identifying threshold  
35 issues and is not all-inclusive or dispositive of Mineral County’s legal positions or arguments.  
36

1 Accordingly, Mineral County reserves the right to change these theories or to assert additional or  
2 different legal theories during the pendency of this case.

3 **1. The Public Trust Doctrine:**

4 Mineral County maintains that the public trust doctrine requires that the waters of the  
5 Walker River Basin be allocated and managed in such a manner as to ensure that sufficient flows  
6 reach Walker Lake to protect the Lake's navigability, fisheries, other wildlife, recreation uses,  
7 and its environmental, scenic and historic values before any water in the Basin can be  
8 appropriated for other uses. *See Illinois Central R. Co. v. State of Illinois*, 146 U.S. 387, 452-456  
9 (1892); *Mineral County v. Nevada*, 20 P.3d 800, 808 (Nev. 2001) (Rose, J., concurring); *In re*  
10 *Water Use Permit Applications*, 94 Hawaii 97, 133, 9 P.3d 409, 445 (2000); *National Audubon*  
11 *Society v. Superior Court of Alpine County*, 33 Cal. 3d 419, 433-448, 658 P.2d 709, 718-729,  
12 *cert. denied*, 464 U.S. 977 (1983); *Pyramid Lake Paiute Tribe of Indians v. Washoe County*, 112  
13 Nev. 743, 748, 918 P.2d 697, 700 (1996); *Kootenai Environmental Alliance v. Panhandle Yacht*  
14 *Club*, 105 Idaho 622, 632, 671 P.2d 1085, 1095 (1983). *See also* Nev. Rev. Stat. § 533.025;  
15 Nev. Rev. Stat. § 533.370(5); Nev. Rev. Stat. § 534.020(1).

16  
17  
18  
19 The severe deficiency of inflows to Walker Lake over the past several decades has  
20 dramatically reduced the Lake's level and water quality. This strangling of Walker Lake has  
21 devastated the Lake's Lahontan cutthroat trout and tui chub fisheries and the local economy of  
22 Mineral County, which is largely dependent on the environmental, scenic, historic and  
23 recreational uses for which Walker Lake is famous, such as fishing, bird watching, boating, and  
24 swimming. The deficiency of water flowing into Walker Lake due to the over-appropriation of  
25 water in the Walker River Basin has gravely damaged, and continues to damage, the Lake's  
26 ecosystem and the communities that are dependent on the Lake. The public trust doctrine  
27 requires that the allocation and management of water rights in the Basin be modified in a manner  
28 sufficient to reverse the ecological and economic damage done by the insufficiency of water  
flowing into Walker Lake over the past several decades.



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this 28<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2007, I electronically filed the foregoing Mineral County's Preliminary Legal Theories with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to the following via their email addresses:

Marta A. Adams

[maadams@ag.state.nv.us](mailto:maadams@ag.state.nv.us) [payoung@ag.state.nv.us](mailto:payoung@ag.state.nv.us)

Gregory W. Addington

[greg.addington@usdoj.gov](mailto:greg.addington@usdoj.gov) [judy.farmer@usdoj.gov](mailto:judy.farmer@usdoj.gov) [joanie.silvershield@usdog.gov](mailto:joanie.silvershield@usdog.gov)

George N. Benesch

[gbenesch@sbcglobal.net](mailto:gbenesch@sbcglobal.net)

Gordon H. DePaoli

[gdepaoli@woodburnandwedge.com](mailto:gdepaoli@woodburnandwedge.com)

Cheri Emm-Smith

[districtattorney@mineralcountynv.org](mailto:districtattorney@mineralcountynv.org)

Dale E. Ferguson

[dferguson@woodburnandwedge.com](mailto:dferguson@woodburnandwedge.com)

John W. Howard

[john@jwhowardattorneys.com](mailto:john@jwhowardattorneys.com) [elisam@whowardattorneys.com](mailto:elisam@whowardattorneys.com)

Erin K. L. Mahaney

[emahaney@waterboards.ca.gov](mailto:emahaney@waterboards.ca.gov)

David L. Negri

[David.negri@usdoj.gov](mailto:David.negri@usdoj.gov)

Michael Neville

[michael.neville@doj.ca.gov](mailto:michael.neville@doj.ca.gov) [cory.marcelino@doj.ca.gov](mailto:cory.marcelino@doj.ca.gov)

Karen A. Peterson

[kpeterson@allisonmackenzie.com](mailto:kpeterson@allisonmackenzie.com) [egarrison@allisonmackenzie.com](mailto:egarrison@allisonmackenzie.com)

Todd A. Plimpton

[tplimpton@msn.com](mailto:tplimpton@msn.com)

1 Susan L. Schneider  
2 [susan.schneider@usdoj.gov](mailto:susan.schneider@usdoj.gov)

3 Laura A. Schroeder  
4 [counsel@water-law.com](mailto:counsel@water-law.com)

5 Stacey Simon  
6 [ssimon@mono.ca.gov](mailto:ssimon@mono.ca.gov)

7 Wes Williams  
8 [wwilliams@standordalumni.org](mailto:wwilliams@standordalumni.org)

9 and I further certify that I served a copy of the foregoing Mineral County's Preliminary Legal  
10 Theories on the following non-CM/ECF participants by U.S Mail, postage prepaid, this 28<sup>th</sup> day  
11 of December, 2007:

12 Ken Spooner  
13 Walker River Irrigation District  
14 P.O. Box 820  
15 Yerington, NV 89447

Tracy Taylor  
State Engineer – Division of Water Resources  
State of Nevada  
901 S. Stewart Street  
Carson City, NV 89701

16 John Kramer  
17 Department of Water Resources  
18 1416 Ninth Street, Room 1118  
19 Sacramento, CA 94814

Jim Shaw  
Chief Dep. Water Commissioner  
U.S. Board of Water Commissioners  
P.O. Box 853  
Yerington, NV 89447

20 William E. Schaeffer, Esq.  
21 P.O. Box 936  
22 Battle Mountain, NV 89820

Robert Auer  
District Attorney for Lyon County  
31 South Main Street  
Yerington, NV 89447

23 Robert L. Hunter, Superintendent  
24 Western Nevada Agency  
25 Bureau of Indian Affairs  
311 E. Washington Street  
Carson City, NV 89701-4065

Brian Stockton, Deputy Attorney General  
Office of Attorney General  
100 North Carson Street  
Carson City, NV 89701-4717

26 Allen Biaggi  
27 Dept. of Conservation & Natural Resources  
28 State of Nevada  
901 S. Stewart Street  
Carson City, NV 89701

Michael F. Mackedon  
P.O. Box 1203  
179 South LaVerne Street  
Fallon, NV 89407

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Nathan Goedde  
Staff Counsel  
California Dept. of Fish & Game  
1416 Ninth Street, Suite 1335  
Sacramento, CA 95814

Kelly R. Chase  
1700 County Road, Suite A  
P.O. Box 2800  
Minden, NV 89423

Gary Stone  
290 South Arlington Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
Reno, NV 89501

/s/Simeon M. Herskovits  
Simeon M. Herskovits